

Dr. Thomas Ludlam
Building 510A
Brookhaven National Laboratory
Upton, NY 11973-5000

Dear Dr. Ludlam:

Enclosed is the Addendum II report to the Scientific Review of the Nose Cone Calorimeter (NCC) detector upgrade proposal held at Brookhaven National Laboratory on July 9, 2007, with attachments of the written responses from the PHENIX Collaboration and Science Review Panel.

The PHENIX Collaboration has responded to the two Department of Energy (DOE) recommendations by attempting to show in more detail the NCC performance and by presenting the case for the π^0 , χ_c , and “prompt” γ physics measurements. The response was evaluated by the original Science Review Panel. However, significant concerns remained following this process. Either the proposed measurements, taken collectively, were of marginal scientific value, or the proponents did not make a convincing case that would support advancing the NCC project.

Based on reviewer’s comments, the DOE Office of Nuclear Physics considers the Collaboration’s response insufficient to take the next step towards the initiation of the NCC project.

The Office of Nuclear Physics will continue to work with you to support outstanding opportunities that would ensure the vitality and scientific productivity of the RHIC program. We look forward to discussions to develop the best path for the future.

Sincerely,

Eugene A. Henry
Director
Physics Research Division
Office of Nuclear Physics

Enclosure

cc: Steven Vigdor, BNL